EFL Learners' Engagement And Its Academic Effects In Shadow Education: Phenomenological Study

Nada Nur Azizah[1*], Joko Nurkamto[2], Kristian Adi Putra[3]

[1,2,3] English Education Department, Sebelas Maret University, Surakarta, Indonesia
*Corresponding Author:
Email: nadanurazizah@student.uns.ac.id

Abstract

In Indonesia, shadow education is becoming a promising educational business, which raises questions about the quality of the teaching at school and factors affecting such a phenomenon. The current phenomenological study aimed to find out kinds of engagement of ten Indonesian English as a Foreign Language (EFL) in Shadow Education (SE). It would also highlight academic effects of shadow education in Indonesia. Grounded in the interpretive paradigm, the study employed a qualitative approach to gain an in-depth and holistic picture of EFL learners' lived experiences at shadow learning in Indonesia. Data were collected mainly through observation and interview. The data were analyzed by using coding and categorized into themes and categories in the meaning making and interpretation process. The study revealed that students were engaged beahiorally, emotionally and cognitively in SE. Dealing with the students' participation in SE, it was found that SE gave good effects for students' academics, such as giving satisfaction, helping them to understand English and prepare examination. Theoretically, study is expected to give understanding on how shadow education affects student engagement and its academic effects. Practically. This study informed teachers about good ELT practices in the SE to be adapted in their classroom .

Keywords: Engagements, Shadow Education and Benefits.

I. INTRODUCTION

In Indonesia, the English language is taught as a foreign language (EFL). Within this EFL context, individuals acquire English skills with the intention of utilizing them to interact with other English speakers globally (Harmer, 2007). Moreover, in this environment, learners seldom have the opportunity to apply the language in their everyday lives (Brown, 2007). Naturally, these circumstances have consequences for language learners. Concurrently, the time allocated for English Language Teaching (ELT) in the formal Indonesian education system is insufficient to cater to the requirements of Indonesian EFL learners. Nevertheless, the anticipation of English proficiency is notably high for learners, primarily to fulfill the demands of the global community, which necessitates English as an international language for purposes such as marketing, job pursuit, immigration, scholarship applications, enrollment in higher education, publishing, and information access.Top of Form The increased academic workplace coupled with the limited school hours results in a heightened requirement for a support system to aid students in their learning journey and accomplishments. Consequently, Indonesian students are actively seeking assistance to meet their English learning needs.

This trend has been described as the cultural norm among the youth, schools, and parents, where tutoring is relied upon for exam preparation and educational success (Bray & Lykins, 2012). A significant portion of students who have undergone English tutoring have expressed that their formal education at both the school and university levels has had limited impacts on enhancing their English communication skills. This phenomenon, in turn, contributes to the widespread prevalence of SE in English in Indonesia.The preceding discussion highlights that various studies have been conducted in other nations to comprehend the phenomenon of shadow education. Although a limited number of studies in Indonesia have explored potential effects on students' motivational strategies, there exists a gap in research within the Indonesian context specifically centered around learners' encounters with shadow education. Consequently, there is a need for further investigation to ascertain what makes students resort to English tutoring and what impacts it has on themselves and their learning. Hence, this research seeks to make a valuable contribution to the

existing literature by scrutinizing learners' encounters with shadow education in Indonesia. Employing a phenomenological approach, this study explores students' engagement and its academic effects on students who actively partake in shadow education.

II.   LITERATURE REVIEW

Tutoring agencies provide the necessary support for students. Private tutoring is described as additional tutorials that complement the education received in formal schools. These tutorials cover a range of subjects and are conducted by instructors for financial compensation (Bray, 2003). Therefore, this description excludes extracurricular tutorials like sports and dancing, as well as any voluntary lessons offered by teachers or family members. This service is often referred to as shadow education because private tutoring establishments coexist alongside mainstream schooling, essentially creating a parallel educational system (Bray, 2014). The terms private tutoring and shadow education are used interchangeably in this study.In recent times, factors such as exam-centric language instruction, inadequate and ineffective classroom teaching, pressure from public examinations, and the absence of a conducive learning environment within classrooms have led to students engaging in shadow education. Learners who choose to participate in shadow education are believed to be seeking academic support due to reasons outlined in various studies. Alotaibi (2014) conducted research involving Saudi secondary school students and their parents to understand the driving forces behind private English tutoring, gathering insights through separate group interviews. Alotaibi identifies several factors contributing to private English tutoring, including the challenges posed by the English language itself, underperforming teachers, societal pressures, discrepancies in students' comprehension levels at school, weak foundational English knowledge from prior school years, frequent student absences, large class sizes, and heavy English teaching workloads.

Moreover, recent research has also delved into the correlation between private tutoring in English and students' academic achievements, especially concerning their English test scores as well as scores in other subjects (Park, Byun, & Kim, 2011). For instance, Kang (2007) presents evidence demonstrating a noteworthy enhancement in South Korean students' grades as a result of investing in tutoring. Kang's study factors in variables such as initial ability assessed by teachers, self-study hours, and family characteristics to isolate the impact of tutoring expenses on academic improvements. Similar findings were reported by studies on English tutoring in Hong Kong (Yung, 2014). Furthermore, English tutoring has recently received attention from researchers (Hamid, Sussex, & Khan, 2009; Yung, 2014). In a recent study in Hong Kong, Bray (2013) shows that the proportion of secondary students (71%) involved in private tutoring in English was much higher than in mathematics (58%) and in Chinese (39%). High rates of student participation in shadow education have also been reported by studies in South and East Asian nations (e.g., Bray & Kwok, 2003; Hamid & Baldauf, 2011).Regarding the factors driving students' involvement in shadow education, it's undeniable that shadow education yields positive outcomes, such as enhancing and advancing students' learning, as well as providing constructive engagements after regular school hours (Bray, 2003; Bray & Suso, 2008). Conversely, private tutoring introduces challenges like deviations from the core curriculum and an additional academic burden on students. Engaging in shadow education might disrupt in-school lessons and lead to fatigue for both students and educators.

More concerning is the occurrence of a troubling scenario where teachers deliberately cover only a portion of the syllabus during school hours, coercing students to pay for private tutorials to learn the remaining material after school (Bray, 2003). Occasionally, private tutors showcase academic achievements in promotional materials and highlight former students' successes through advertisements. Such tactics aim to stimulate the "executive motives" of learners and cultivate a positive tutor-student relationship. Essentially, by emphasizing the significance of exams and grades, private tutors encourage students to fulfill their responsibilities and duties, thereby mitigating potential negative outcomes. Despite the apparent conflict between shadow education and conventional education, learners appear to lean towards shadow education. As opportunities for higher education become more attainable, an increasing number of students are pursuing private tutoring to enhance their preparation for admission tests. They exhibit a heightened motivation to invest their time and effort into private tutoring to maximize their chances of gaining admission to esteemed

universities (Yung & Bray, 2017). Ultimately, this is driven by the desire to enhance their academic outcomes within mainstream education. Private tutors are also perceived as offering a more conducive learning atmosphere compared to conventional classroom instruction. To achieve this, tutors employ engaging techniques such as narrating captivating stories and incorporating humor into lessons. Furthermore, in their quest to create an optimal learning environment, tutors occasionally arrange smaller groups of students.

III.   METHODS

To explore students' engagement and their reflections on their supplementary tutoring experience, the study adopted a phenomenological study as an approach to gain an in-depth and holistic picture of shadow learning in Indonesia (Merriam, 1998). It helped the researcher to explore the phenomenon in a "natural setting" (Denzin and Lincoln, 1994), where respondents had actually lived and experienced (Creswell, 2007), and to interpret the subjective meanings from the respondents' perspectives (Muijs, 2004). An urban public tutoring was purposefully selected as research sites because of their uniqueness and easy access. Apart from the sites' easy access, three others specific uniquenesses were considered to decide their selection: Firstly, both of the institution was information-rich. Secondly, no studies have been conducted in the institution, although their students consume a high rate of private tutoring. Thirdly, both of the colleges were considered to have a high level of "education zeal" in the Surakarta division, a part of Central Java. Due to limited resources and time constraints, this study concentrated solely on secondary education, a critical period of students' academic live in Indonesia.Through purposeful sampling, the researchers deliberately selected 7 participants from the first year of higher secondary school to engage in in-depth interviews.

These students were chosen based on their active participation in tutoring and possessing a minimum of one to four years of experience in the domain of shadow education. To protect privacy, all participants were assigned pseudonyms.The rationale behind selecting higher secondary school students was to obtain a comprehensive and lucid understanding of their encounters with shadow education. These students had completed 11 to 12 years of schooling and were on the verge of facing examinations and university entrance in the upcoming academic year. Significantly, English lessons are a part of the curriculum in Indonesia from Grades 7 to 12, implying that these students had been exposed to substantial English education within the school system. Thus, their participation in SE at the higher secondary level offered valuable insights into their experiences, shedding light on potential inequalities among students. Importantly, this study employed selective sampling to analyze data in an inductive, recursive, and interactive manner. This approach was adopted to present a comprehensive and holistic perspective on the phenomenon of SE.

IV.   RESULT AND DISCUSSION

In order to respond to the two research questions, this section is split into two segments: (1) kinds of engagements are presented of EFL students in the shadow education and, 2) the benefits do students experience from attending shadow education.

1.   EFL Students' Engagement in the Shadow Education

The results for Research question 1 were obtained through descriptive coding of student responses from both initial and post-observation interviews. The initial interviews aimed to gain a clear understanding of students' perceptions of engagement, while the post-observation interviews focused on assessing their behavioral, emotional, and cognitive engagement during unannounced classroom observations, each lasting 45 minutes. These observations were carried out using the Indicators of Student Engagement Observation. Classroom observations were conducted in the study, consisting of three observations for each of the 10 students. Although not directly addressing research question one, the classroom observation data enhanced the dataset by offering an objective glimpse into the students' lived experiences regarding student engagement.

To ensure objectivity, the researcher conducted preparatory activities before commencing the study. During these preparations, all aspects of classroom observation were reviewed, questions and misunderstandings were addressed, the importance of objective observation was emphasized, and the focus was on identifying what was observed rather than making assumptions. As part of this process, the researcher engaged in role-playing activities to align expectations and establish a collective understanding of examples and non-examples. For every observed lesson, the researcher identified indicators for high, active student engagement only when they were observed. The Indicators of Student Engagement Observation for English contained five indicators of behavioral engagement, four indicators of emotional engagement, and four indicators of cognitive engagement. After reporting scores for all three classroom observations, an average for each engagement component was readily discernible.

Table 1. Average Observer Scoring of Student Engagement

Student	Type of engagement		
	Behavioral	Emotional	Cognitive
1	56%	75%	45%
2	32%	45%	48%
3	40%	50%	45%
4	88%	85%	60%
5	76%	95%	75%
6	72%	85%	80%
7	76%	90%	60%
8	72%	90%	75%
9	84%	100%	70%
10	72%	80%	75%

From the table above it can be seen that 8 out of 10 students often attend tutoring and participate in learning. It can be seen that eight students have a level of behavioral engagement of more than 50% and only two students are involved in learning. The percentage is seen from observations made by researchers at the tutoring site. Through the five indicators included in behavioral engagement, the eight students often came to the tutoring place, took part in asking questions and answers to the teacher and having discussions with friends to understand the material being studied. This can be strengthened by interviews with students which are conducted after learning is completed. This explanation will be displayed in the interview section. Next, there was only one student who had low emotional involvement, namely S2. S2 through observation was only 45% emotionally involved. This is in accordance with interviews conducted by researchers with S2. That S2 is not too happy to take part in English language lessons at tutoring places. This is because these students get more encouragement from their parents to take English lessons. The other nine students were emotionally involved in the tutoring setting. This means that they are happy and enjoy learning English at the tutoring place.

To observe for cognitive engagement, the researcher observed for student investment in learning such as going beyond requirements, directing effort towards understanding and mastery. Most of students on site have an engagement rate of more than 50%. Through observation, these seven students have good focus when studying in tutoring, can understand the material well and have high initiative and willingness to learn English. These findings suggest that student perceptions of behavioral engagement and emotional engagement and cognitive engagement mostly aligned to what was observed. Throughout the student interview processes all students mentioned some of perceptions that belong to the indicator of the behavior, emotional and cognitive engagement. Here are some examples of types of student engagement in English tutoring class.

Behavioral Engagement

In behavioral engagement, there are five indicators: active participation, presence, completing assignments and initiative (Fedrick et al., 2004). In most cases, behavioral engagement occurs during classroom meetings. Students who are participate active in their class through participating in the whole session classroom activities. Their active participation was shown clearly during the learning activity. In terms of asking the teacher or friends and supporting peers, students responded to the teacher and peer's opinions or questions in the discussion. As student 5 and 7 interview result.

"I think I'm one of the active students, I keep my hand rise up to ask something in class. Like, I just asked Miss Eka what I don't know, if not, I asked a friend" (S5)

According to him, he is an active student when taking part in lessons. This can be seen from the answers he gave regarding what kind of activities he had done during the process of learning English in shadow education. He answered that he often asked the teacher and his friends in class when he faced difficulties, such as not understanding the material being studied at that time. moreover, students' behavioral engagement was prominently shown when he consistently asking and having discussion with the teacher and his peers. Therefore, the role of the teacher is crucial in facilitating, guiding, and motivating the learner. It is in line with Abou-Khalil et al. (2021), Anjarwati and Sa'adah (2021), Bond and Bedenlier (2019), Dwivedi et al. (2019), Hollister et al. (2022), Malkin et al. (2018), and Xu et al. (2020).

Emotional Engagement

Emotional engagement includes four indicators: expression, recognizing motivations, enthusiasm, and positive interaction. As a rule, emotional engagement occurs during English tutoring class. The expression of students who emotionally engaged in English tutoring class were happy and enjoy their time to do activities in learning process. Students also appreciate the success of the learning process through their enthusiasm and interest. They also showed that they recognize their motivation and commitment to learning process. From the English tutoring class, there was one unidentified indicator: positive interactions. This indicator deals with whether the students work harder than they thought during the learning process. In English tutoring class, students had to interact with peers also the teacher and discussion. By completing all individual and group assignments, students could recognize their motivations as they were interested in the learning process. In the term of students' expression in English tutoring class. Here the interview of the student who emotionally engaged in English tutoring class. The data also demonstrate that the interviewees were happy differently, depending on what their goal and their perception about learning English in SE.

"That's great, it's also important to speak English, because now the requirements for school and work seem to be that many people have to be able to speak English" (S6)

S2 mentioned that even if students received good results on public examinations, it could be misleading because they might only know how to score well. He further explained that in EPT, students memorized a lot of vocabulary items and sentence structures, but they might not remember them after they finished the examination.

"It's easier to understand in a tutoring place so I like to learn a lot of new vocabulary that I get and how to construct sentences correctly" (S8)

Compared with relatively conservative mainstream schooling, shadow education is diverse, market-oriented and more finely divided in educational design. Since the inception of shadow education, many tutors, administrators, and families have regarded it as a free space for those seeking educational autonomy and alternative choices (Zhang & Bray, 2020). Shadow education services help parents who lack the knowledge to teach when children approach them for assistance, and to reduce the anxiety of parents and students. Moreover, parents believe that tutoring services are professionals in what they do and children would be in good hands with them after school as they help children with homework or review of exam preparation etc. (Charoenkul, 2018). Students who attend shadow educational services will eventually gain self-confidence in subjects that were once problematic for them. In a Thai case study, Saengboon (2019) stated that shadow education services helped increase students' overall confidence in school, improved their understanding of subjects, and yielded better results in tests.

Cognitive Engagement

Cognitive engagement includes six indicators: focus, integrating ideas, problem solving, developing deep discipline understandings, and curiosity. Overall, cognitive engagement occurs during learning English in shadow education. Some students participated actively during the discussion by volunteer or nomination. Unfortunately for the first indicator, namely focus, many of the students in the tutoring center were not focused at the start of learning. Most of them said that tiredness was something that prevented them from focusing when learning English in tutoring. The following is an example of student interview results.

"Tired because I came home late in the afternoon and continued studying" (S1)
"Tired, if I'm in the first few minutes of class, I'm really just coming home from school" (S5)

Two students represented that they had to use their remaining energy after studying all day at school to return to get additional English lessons at the tutoring site. They do not have time to rest before continuing their learning activities outside of school. They also have to travel several minutes to get to the tutoring place, because the distance between the school and the tutoring place takes about 5 minutes to reach. But the students' lack of focus did not last long. They just lack focus at the beginning of learning. Then they try to follow the learning process.

More than two students said that they had the same way of understanding the material presented by their tutor. Namely by making notes and reading them again so that their understanding is more comprehensive. Student 8 and 2 said the same thing as follows

Take notes and read again miss (S8)

At least open a book and keep reading(S2)

They believe that making notes about important points in English and then reading them again is one way that can be used so that they can understand the material given by the tutor easily. Student 7 added "Be sure to practice missing questions" by doing lots of practice questions, which can also be an alternative to better understand the material that has been taught. Apart from several efforts made by students to be able to understand English language material in tutoring places. They also realize that the importance of learning English is not only for the present, but they believe that by learning English since attending high school, it can be used as a tool for going to the next level of school, namely choosing the desired university or working, especially for communicating globally. This is what student 9 said, "It's also important to miss at school whether you're working or going to college. He also added how he applies the knowledge he has gained with simple practice. "*My current way of knowing English is taking lessons, sometimes practicing speaking a little, and listening to podcast.*"

In summary, we find most of student engage into the English tutoring in shadow education. their interviews told that education helps high-achieving students because it causes them to spend more time on their other studies. We also find little students that disengage in shadow education and they are fails to get more from English tutoring because it causes them to spend less time on their other out-of school studies.

B. The Benefits that Students Experience from Shadow Education

In order to understand the benefits of English tutoring, the researcher interviewed ten students. the result of the data collected shows there are some benefits of English tutoring that students get from it. in their beliefs, English tutoring gives (1) satisfaction (2) help students to understand the material/find the easier way (3) prepare the examination.

Giving satisfaction

From the data collected from interviews conducted with the ten participants, the first finding is that experienced in shadow education gives the students' satisfaction. Most of the students stated that they are satisfied because by joining to the English tutoring in shadow education the feel happy, enjoy and get some benefits for it, as explained by two of the students:

To be honest, at school I didn't understand the explanation given by my school teacher, so this tutoring helped me to improve my score which was previously far from the passing standard.(S3)

So I don't feel like it's a loss to pay at the tutoring place (S7, emphasis added)

Both students expressed their satisfaction in attending English tutoring. they feel happy with learning in English tutoring and with the results obtained, such as their grades can improve, although not too significantly. In the first quote, S3 explicitly says that she scores better because of tutoring and the learning strategies he is taught at shadow education Feeling emotionally supported and respected by teachers in shadow education was found to contribute greatly to the participant's overall satisfaction with their school and money that they have paid. Like Nath's (2008) study, participants in the current study experienced teachers' ability to fulfill the happiness of students in the English tutoring. Similar to Nath's finding as "the shadow education are generally able to provide the students' need that is desired." all participants,

irrespective their locations and types of school and tutoring, considered English tutoring as a accomplishment of their satisfactions.

Helping students to understand the material/find the easier way

Private tutoring serves as a valuable means to enhance understanding of subjects, instill confidence, and foster crucial learning skills. Through personalized attention, tutoring addresses the limitations of crowded classrooms, offering students a unique opportunity for individualized support. This customized approach contributes to a deeper comprehension of subjects, instills a sense of confidence, and cultivates essential learning skills. As student 2 said that

the tutoring session proves beneficial to me, as it clarifies challenging materials that were not thoroughly covered in the regular class. Attending English tutoring provides a clearer understanding of these complex topics. (S2)

The student said that by taking English tutoring, the tutor really helped him to better understand material that he had not previously understood at school. By using the method given by the tutor in the English tutoring class, it is easier for him to understand the English material. Placing SE in the context of upper secondary education, students are increasingly instrumental in what and how they earn, as students increasingly adopt strategies (McCoy et al., 2019). He also added that "the tutor at the tutoring center taught me how to do questions more effectively". This shows that English private tutoring can improve students' understanding of school material. In further conversation with S1, she mentioned that "my tutor at the English tutoring had been motivated by the belief that the easiest way to enhance my vocabulary was to promptly discover the meaning of the English words I had just encountered or read, and then compile a list".

Prepare the examination

Most of students concurred that the inclusion of shadow education plays a pivotal role in fostering the development of skills crucial for exams, with a particular emphasis on enhancing planning abilities. Moreover, the respondents articulated that engagement in shadow education not only hones their exam-related skills but also empowers them to take on a more active role within the classroom setting. As the answer of two students as follows:

I *often come to the tutoring center when I'm just approaching an exam, because when it's approaching an exam, the tutoring center provides training which gives lots of practice exam questions that are in line with the school's grid (S3)*

I'm grateful to be able to take lessons at this place and get a tutor who is patient and fun so that the students at the tutoring place don't hesitate to ask questions and are active in providing feedback in class. (S6)

In her statement, the student reveals a consistent practice of frequenting the English tutoring as exams draw near. The motivation behind this tendency lies in the specialized training offered by the center, encompassing a wealth of practice exam questions thoughtfully designed to align with the school curriculum (S3). The student expresses gratitude for the opportunity to partake in lessons at this establishment, emphasizing the importance of having a tutor who is both patient and enjoyable. The tutor's demeanor plays a crucial role in fostering a comfortable atmosphere within the tutoring center, where students feel encouraged to pose questions and actively engage in providing feedback during class (S6). Those effect has also been highlighted when large proportions of students receive SE, teachers may assume that their students have supplementary support and make less effort than they would otherwise (Bray et al. 2016).In essence, the student underscores the benefits derived from attending the English tutoring center. These benefits include access to tailor-made training materials specifically crafted to prepare students for upcoming exams. Furthermore, the English tutoring center cultivates a supportive and interactive learning environment, enhancing the overall educational experience for those seeking academic assistance and guidance.

As same as to the other studies that show students' perception of poor English teaching at school as a main reason for receiving EPT (e.g., Hamid et al., 2009), learners in this study necessarily feel that schoolteachers taught poorly. Because of the examination-oriented education system, which is deeply rooted in many Asian settings like Hong Kong and mainland China (Carless, 2012; Watkins, 2009) and is increasingly prevalent worldwide (Clarke & Morgan, 2011; Frick, 2013), they were willing to sacrifice their free time to study for examinations, in hopes of a better chance to pursue higher education (Bray & Lykins,

2012; Carless, 2012; Kwok, 2004). They sought help from EPT to learn examination skills, which the mainstream schooling could not fully account for. In this regard, they saw EPT as performing a valuable function relative to the perceived shortcomings of mainstream education.

Summarizing the conclusions drawn from this section, it is evident that students generally had positive experiences with their English tutoring. They held the belief that English tutoring played a significant role in enhancing their examination skills, acknowledging its effectiveness in that particular aspect. However, their perception of its impact on everyday English proficiency and fostering a genuine interest in the language was less pronounced. Despite these nuances, students displayed a willingness to embrace the examination-oriented nature of the English tutoring sessions, ultimately maintaining a positive attitude towards the overall English tutoring experience. Upon careful reflection and considering the insights gained from their participation in shadow education, the students, on the whole, expressed a shared conviction that secondary school students would benefit from involvement in the realm of English tutoring. This belief underscores the perceived value of English tutoring, particularly in the context of preparing students for examinations and reinforcing essential examination-related skills within the framework of secondary education.Regarding to the benefits of their English tutoring experiences in shadoweducation, it was discovered that from students' perspectives, shadow education can offer meaningful places to self-study, to receive career support, and to improve performance. Although students had ample opportunities to voice negative experiences, even discontent, with their shadow education, all respondents did not.

Thus, instead of referring to their experiences with shadow education as positive or negative, students mostly embrace its benefits. The conceptualization of shadow education as an alternative place builds upon, but does not echo, student-centred work on shadow education; for instance in the United Kingdom (Hajar, 2018, 2019), Bangladesh (Mahmud, 2019), and Israel (Addi-Raccah, 2019). Whereas in such previous studies students report relatively negative student experiences regarding shadow education and its examination-orientedness, none of the participants in our study expressed such negative experiences. The difference in results may be explained by the different schooling systems in which the research was conducted, but also by the fact that our phrasing of the questions was open, whereas previous research intentionally asked students to recall negative experiences. To fully understand the role of shadow education in students' academic lives, we also need an examination of the experiences of students who are not enrolled in shadow education, which we were not able to do in this study. Some of the participants did express emotions such as relief and satisfaction as a result of their shadow education attendance.

V.   CONCLUSION

The objective of this research was to identify the various types of engagement observed in English learning within shadow education. According to the study's findings, students exhibited behavioral, emotional, and cognitive engagement across all forms of learning carried out in traditional classrooms. They demonstrated commendable performance, learning behaviors, and attitudes both in face-to-face and online Integrated English tutoring sessions. As highlighted in this study, students seem to be losing confidence in classroom-based instruction, leading them to seek English tutoring in shadow education. Such tutoring aids them in comprehending the material better compared to their formal schooling. Essentially, factors such as classroom environment, organization, short class durations, large class sizes, and inconsistent session schedules render traditional classroom instruction ineffective and irrelevant, especially in terms of public examination outcomes. To put it more plainly, teachers' motivation, skills, incentives, and working conditions fail to support effective teaching and learning within schools.

REFERENCES

[1]   Abou-Khalil, V., Helou, S., Khalifé, E., Chen, M. A., Majumdar, R., & Ogata, H. (2021). Emergency Online Learning in Low-Resource Settings: Effective Student Engagement Strategies. Education Sciences, 11(1), 24.

[2]   Addi-Raccah,A.(2019).Private tutoring in a high socio-economic secondary school in Israel and pupils' attitudes towards school learning:A double-edged sword phenomenon.*British Educational Research Journal,*938–960.

[3]   Alotaibi, G. N. (2014). Causes of private tutoring in English: Perspectives of Saudi secondary school students and their parents. Alotaibi | Studies in Literature and Language. https://doi.org/10.3968/n

[4]   Anjarwati, R., & Sa'adah, L. (2021). Student learning engagement in the online class. *EnJourMe (English Journal of Merdeka)* : Culture, Language, and Teaching of English, 6(2), 39–49. https://doi.org/10.26905/enjourme.v6i2.6128

[5]   Bond, M., & Bedenlier, S. (2019). Facilitating student engagement through educational Technology: towards a conceptual framework. *Journal of Interactive Media in Education,* 2019(1). https://doi.org/10.5334/jime.528

[6]   Bray, M. (2003). Adverse effects of supplementary private tutoring: dimensions, implications, and government responses.

[7]   Harahap, A. et, all, Macrozoobenthos diversity as anbioindicator of the water quality in the Sungai Kualuh Labuhanbatu Utara, AACL Bioflux, 2022, Vol 15, Issue 6.

[8]   Bray, M. (2013). Shadow Education: Comparative perspectives on the expansion and implications of private supplementary tutoring. Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences, 77, 412–420.

[9]   Bray, M. (2014). The impact of shadow education on student academic achievement: Why the research is inconclusive and what can be done about it. Asia Pacific Education Review, 15(3), 381–389.

[10] Bray, M., & Kwok, P. L. Y. (2003). Demand for private supplementary tutoring: conceptual considerations, and socio-economic patterns in Hong Kong. Economics of Education Review, 22(6), 611–620.

[11] Bray, M., & Lykins, C. (2012). Shadow Education: Private Tutoring and its Implications for Policy Makers in Asia.

[12] Bray, M., & Lykins, C. (2012). Shadow Education: Private Tutoring and its Implications for Policy Makers in Asia.

[13] Bray, Mark & Suso, Emmanuelle. (2008). The challenges of private supplementary private tutoring: Global patterns and their implications for Africa. Association for the Development of Education in Africa (ADEA) Biennale, Maputo, Mozambique, 5-9 Mei 2008.

[14] Brown, H. D. (2007). Principles of Language Learning and Teaching (5th Ed.). New York Longman - References - Scientific Research Publishing. (n.d.). https://www.scirp.org/reference/referencespapers?referenceid=3171799

[15] Carless, D. (2012). From testing to productive student learning: Implementing formative assessment in Confucian-Heritage settings. Routledge Research in Education. Routledge, Taylor & Francis Group. https://eric.ed.gov/?id=ED527621

[16] Harahap, Arman ,2018, Macrozoobenthos diversity as bioindicator of water quality in the Bilah river, Rantauprapat, *Medan. J. Phys.*: Conf. Ser. 1116 052026.

[17] Charoenkul, N. (2018). Shadow education in Thailand: Thai and international perspectives. In Education in the Asia-Pacific region (pp. 627–650). https://doi.org/10.1007/978-981-10-7857-6_25

[18] Clarke, M., & Morgan, B. (2011). Chapter 4. Education and Social Justice in Neoliberal Times: Historical and Pedagogical Perspectives from Two Postcolonial Contexts. In Multilingual Matters eBooks (pp. 63–85).

[19] Creswell, J. W. (2007). Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design Choosing among Five Approaches (2nd ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA Sage Publications. - References - Scientific Research Publishing. (n.d.). https://www.scirp.org/reference/referencespapers?referenceid=2588183

[20] Denzin, N. K., and Lincoln, Y. S. (1994). "Introduction: entering the field of qualitative research," in Handbook of Qualitative Research (Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage), 1–17.

[21] Fredricks, J. A., Blumenfeld, P. C., & Paris, A. H. (2004). School engagement: potential of the concept, state of the evidence. Review of Educational Research, 74(1), 59–109. https://doi.org/10.3102/00346543074001059

[22] Frick, B. (2013). Fostering student creativity in the era of high-stakes testing. In J. Hattie & E. M. Anderman (Eds.), International guide to student achievement (pp. 231–233). New York, NY: Routledge

[23] Hajar, A. (2018). Exploring Year 6 pupils' perceptions of private tutoring: evidence from three mainstream schools in England. Oxford Review of Education, 44(4), 514–531.

[24] Hajar, A. (2019). A critical review of research on language learning strategies used by Arab learners of English. Nazarbayev University.

[25] Hamid, M. (2011). English and socio-economic disadvantage: learner voices from rural Bangladesh. https://www.semanticscholar.org/paper/English-and-socio-economic-disadvantage%3A-learner-Hamid-Baldauf/16b735315e48af271841817a73eda723860355d4

[26] Hamid, M. O., & Baldauf, R. B. (2011). English and socio-economic disadvantage: learner voices from rural Bangladesh. *Language Learning Journal,* 39(2), 201–217. https://doi.org/10.1080/09571736.2011.573687

[27] Hamid, M. O., Sussex, R., & Khan, A. (2009). Private tutoring in English for secondary school students in Bangladesh. TESOL Quarterly, 43(2), 281–308. https://doi.org/10.1002/j.1545-7249.2009.tb00168.x

[28] Hamid, M. O., Sussex, R., & Khan, A. (2009). Private tutoring in English for secondary school students in Bangladesh. TESOL Quarterly, 43(2), 281–308. https://doi.org/10.1002/j.1545-7249.2009.tb00168.x

[29] Harmer, J. (2007). How to teach English. Harlow Pearson Longman. - References - Scientific Research Publishing. (n.d.). https://www.scirp.org/reference/referencespapers?referenceid=2623087

[30] Hollister, B., Nair, P., Hill-Lindsay, S., & Chukoskie, L. (2022). Engagement in Online Learning: Student attitudes and behavior during COVID-19. Frontiers in Education, 7. https://doi.org/10.3389/feduc.2022.851019

[31] Kang, C. (2007). Does money matter? The effect of private educational expenditures on academic performance. https://www.semanticscholar.org/paper/Does-Money-Matter-The-Effect-of-Private-Educational-Kang/7a0b18b9f458fa5b9a98fd11463864f05afd87df

[32] Kwok, P. L. Y. (2004). Examination-Oriented knowledge and value transformation in East Asian Cram Schools. Asia Pacific Education Review, 5(1), 64–75. https://doi.org/10.1007/bf03026280

[33] Mahmud, R. (2020). Mixed implications of private supplementary tutoring for students' learning: Urban and rural disparities in Bangladesh. Drshoaibopenu. https://www.academia.edu/44315492/Mixed_implications_of_private_supplementary_tutoring_for_students_learning_Urban_and_rural_disparities_in_Bangladesh

[34] Malkin, L., Abbot-Smith, K., & Williams, D. M. (2018). Is verbal reference impaired in autism spectrum disorder? A systematic review. Autism & Developmental Language Impairments, 3, 239694151876316.

[35] Merriam, S. B. (1998). Qualitative Research and Case Study Applications in Education. San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass

[36] Harahap, A. P. Hrp, N.K.A.R. Dewi, Macrozoobenthos diversity as anbioindicator of the water quality in the River Kualuh Labuhanbatu Utara, *International Journal of Scientific & Technology Research*, 9(4), 2020, pp. 179-183.

[37] Muijs, D. (2004). Doing Quantitative Research in Education with SPSS. https://doi.org/10.4135/9781849209014

[38] Nath, S. R. (2008). Private supplementary tutoring among primary students in Bangladesh. Educ. Stud. 34,55–72.

[39] Park, H., Byun, S., & Kim, K. K. (2011). Parental involvement and students' cognitive outcomes in Korea. Sociology of Education, 84(1), 3–22. https://doi.org/10.1177/0038040710392719

[40] Saengboon, S. (2019). Shadow Education in Thailand: A Case Study of Thai English Tutors' Perspectives towards the Roles of Private Supplementary Tutoring in Improving English Language Skills. https://www.semanticscholar.org/paper/Shadow-Education-in-Thailand%3A-A-Case-Study-of-Thai-Saengboon/542631622009231d81650a214f3e22caa1638d71

[41] Watkins, D. (2009). Motivation and competition in Hong Kong Secondary Schools: the Students' perspective. In Springer eBooks (pp. 71–88). https://doi.org/10.1007/978-90-481-3840-1_3

[42] Xu, B., Chen, N. S., & Chen, G. (2020). Effects of teacher role on student engagement in WeChat-based online discussion learning. Computers and Education, 157. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.compedu.2020.10395

[43] Yung, K. (2014). Learning English in the Shadows: Understanding Chinese learners' experiences of private tutoring. TESOL Quarterly, 49(4), 707–732. https://doi.org/10.1002/tesq.193

[44] Yung, K. W., & Bray, M. (2017). Shadow education: Features, expansion and implications. ResearchGate.https://www.researchgate.net/publication/313678401_Shadow_education_Features_expansion_and_implications

[45] Zhang, W., & Bray, M. (2020). Comparative Research on Shadow Education Achievements, Challenges, and the Agenda Ahead. *European Journal of Education*, 55, 322-341. - References - Scientific Research Publishing. (n.d.). https://www.scirp.org/reference/referenc espapers?referenceid=3325967.